CAMBRIDGE NETWORK 2017 REPORT, Cambridge Bioethics Education Turkey Working Group Report 2017

7th Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education, 03-05 July 2017, Paris - France

On behalf of the Network: Yeşim İşıl ÜLMAN
Contents

• Presentation of the Cambridge Network as poster at AMEE 2016 by Yolande Voskes et al, Barcelona, 27-30 August 2016................................................................. 2
  o Cambridge Network Poster ........................................................................ 4
  o VIII. Turkey Workshop Meeting Notes and Decisions .............................. 7
  o Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education Working Groups 3. Interim Meeting Report ........................................................................................................ 14
• Upcoming Events ........................................................................................... 16
• Alphabetical List of Contributors ................................................................ 16
Poster Presented at the AMEE 2016 Congress introducing Cambridge Network

The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups Network: aims and experiences

Yolande Voskes*1, Yesim Isil Ulman2, Menno de Bree3, Kevser Vatansever4, Mariëlle Diepeveen1, Guy Widdershoven1

1VU University Medical Center, Amsterdam, the Netherlands, 2Acibadem University, Istanbul, Turkey, 3University Medical Center Groningen, Groningen, the Netherlands, 4Ege University, Izmir, Turkey

The Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education¹ Established by Cambridge University Press in 2011, the consortium aims to develop bioethics education through annual meetings in Paris with other bioethics educators around the world.

A Network of Country-based Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups² The Consortium initiated country-based Working Groups to encourage people and institutions to work together on developing bioethics education in their countries. Coordinators of the Working Groups form a Network which meets twice a year.

Aims of the Network To foster bioethics education, by exchange of information and collaboration between national Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education Working Groups. The focus of exchange and cooperation is on teaching content, methodology and organisation, in line with the objectives of the Cambridge Consortium on Bioethics Education.

Structure The network participants are coordinators of national Cambridge Working Groups. For each country, one participant is member of the board of the network. The executive board of the network consists of Guy Widdershoven (President), Yesim Isil Ulman (General Secretary), Vojin Radic (member) and Peter Kakuk (member).

Members Britain, Germany, Hungary, Italy, New Zealand, Pan-Arab (Lebanon), Romania, Russia, Serbia, Spain, Switzerland, The Netherlands and Turkey.

Activities Cambridge Bioethics Education Network Interim Meeting II: Istanbul Acibadem University School of Medicine, 2016 Representatives of country working groups of Hungary, Lebanon, The Netherlands, Serbia, Spain and Turkey came together to exchange best practices on teaching bioethics (incl. Moral Case Deliberation, case-based ethics teaching, use of cinema in ethics education, skills training for informed consent) and to discuss future collaboration.
The following actions will be taken:

- Hungary, Netherlands, Spain and Turkey WG’s: Applying to ERASMUS+, April 2017
- Turkey WG: prepare COST Action
- All WG’s, coordinated by the Netherlands and Turkey: Making a proposal for an AMEE Guide on Ethics teaching
- All WG’s: Reporting the Network activities, reporting on activities during a special session at the 6th Cambridge Consortium in Paris in July 2016.

An Example of activities in a Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Group: Turkey

The Turkey WG is based in Istanbul Acibadem University. The aim is to raise awareness in and enhance advocacy of ethics education in health sciences education in Turkey. The WG arranged the following activities:

- 7 workshops have been organized
- The Group introduced itself by a paper and conducted a workshop on "Can ethics be taught?" at the 2nd Conference of International Association of Ethics Education, Ankara, 2014
- Two articles were published in Turkish Journal of Bioethics.

Websites

1. http://www.icmbioethics.com
2. http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displaySpecialPage?pageId=4964

Acknowledgement: The Working Groups, collaborating under the umbrella of THE CAMBRIDGE CONSORTIUM OF BIOETHICS EDUCATION, are thankful to Prof. Dr. Thomasine Kushner for her leadership and enthusiasm in supporting country working groups.

***

The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups
Network: aims and experiences

Yolande Voskés1, Yesim Isil Ulman2, Menno de Bree3, Kevser Vatansever3, Mariëlle Diepeveen4, Guy Widdershoven1

1VU University Medical Center, Amsterdam, the Netherlands
2Abıdemos University, Istanbul, Turkey
3University Medical Center Groningen, Groningen, the Netherlands
4Ege University, Izmir, Turkey

The Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education

Established by Cambridge University Press in 2011, the consortium aims to develop bioethics education through annual meetings in Paris with other bioethics educators around the world.

A Network of Country-based Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups

The Consortium initiated country-based Working Groups to encourage people and institutions to work together on developing bioethics education in their countries. Coordinators of the Working Groups form a Network which meets twice a year.

Aims of the Network
To foster bioethics education, by exchange of information and collaboration between national Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education Working Groups. The focus of exchange and cooperation is on teaching content, methodology and organisation, in line with the objectives of the Cambridge Consortium on Bioethics Education.

Structure
The network participants are coordinators of national Cambridge Working Groups. For each country, one participant is member of the board of the network. The executive board of the network consists of Guy Widdershoven (President), Yesim Isil Ulman (General Secretary), Vojin Radić (member) and Peter Kukas (member).

Members
- Britain, Germany, Hungary, Italy, New Zealand, Pan Arab (Lebanon), Romania, Russia, Serbia, Spain, Switzerland, The Netherlands and Turkey.

Activities
- The Network meets twice a year, including the Paris Consortium meeting.
- The activities focus on exchange of information on content, methods and organisation of bioethics education.
- A comparative study is planned on teaching methodology and content among the countries.
- Participants will cooperate in exploration of funding for activities and travel (keeping a focus on the main aims of the network).

Network Activities
- Cambridge Bioethics Education Network Interim Meeting I: Amsterdam VUMC, Dep. of Medical Humanities, 2015

Representatives of country WG’s from Hungary, The Netherlands, Serbia, Switzerland and Turkey came together to exchange experiences and explore the opportunities for mutual, multi-centered research for the WG’s in the Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education.

Acknowledgement
The Working Groups, collaborating under the umbrella of the Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education, are thankful to Prof. Dr. ثمي ثامر for her leadership and motivation in supporting country Working Groups.

The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups Network: aims and experiences

The following actions will be taken:
- Hungary, Netherlands, Spain and Turkey WG’s: Applying to ERASMUS, April 2017
- Turkey WG: prepare COST Action
- All WG’s, coordinated by the Netherlands and Turkey: Making a proposal for an AMEE Guide on Ethics teaching
- All WG’s: Reporting the Network activities, reporting on activities during a special session at the 6th Cambridge Consortium in Paris in July 2016.

An Example of activities in a Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Group: Turkey

The Turkey WG is based in Istanbul Abıdemos University. The aim is to raise awareness in and enhance advocacy of ethics education in healthcare sciences education in Turkey. The WG arranged the following activities:
- 7 workshops have been organized
- The Group introduced itself by a paper and conducted a workshop on “Can ethics be taught?” at the 2nd Conference of International Association of Ethics Education, Ankara, 2014
- Two articles were published in Turkish Journal of Bioethics.

Websites
3. http://www.abellesen.ROUTE.html#tikili/katalo/temelgel/strings/dayfile/3hsout-is.p...
Cambridge Biyoetik Eğitimi
Türkiye Çalışma Grubu
VIII. Çalıştayı
“Türkiye Çalışma Grubu 2016-2017 Dönemi Planlaması”
“Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Group, 2016-2017 Kick off Meeting”
İstanbul, 7 Ekim 2016 / 7 October 2016

İletişim / Contact: Acıbadem Univ. Tıp Tarihi ve Etik / History of Medicine and Ethics Dept.
Kayışdağ cad. No.32. Ataşehir-Istanbul
# VIII. Çalıştayı / Workshop VIII

Acıbadem Üniversitesi Tıp Fakültesi /Acıbadem Univ. School of Medicine, 07 Ekim 2016 / 07 October 2016

## Gündem / Agenda

### Açılış / Opening

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Çalışma Alanı</th>
<th>Sunucu</th>
<th>Zaman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VI. Consortium of Bioethics Education</td>
<td>Yeşim Işıl Ülman</td>
<td>10.30-11.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paris June 2015, Impressions</td>
<td>M. Volkan Kavas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Moderator:</strong> Nadi Bakırcı</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Kahve Arası / Break

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zaman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.30-11.45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### AMEE Congress the Poster of Cambridge Network

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Çalışma Alanı</th>
<th>Sunucu</th>
<th>Zaman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AMEE Congress the Poster of Cambridge Network</td>
<td>Kevser Vatansever</td>
<td>11.45-12.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Moderator:</strong> Pinar Topsever</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Yemek / Lunch

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zaman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.30-13.30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### COST Action Application

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Çalışma Alanı</th>
<th>Sunucu</th>
<th>Zaman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>COST Action Application</td>
<td>M. Volkan Kavas</td>
<td>13.30-14.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TÜBİTAK 3001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curricular Inventory Study</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambridge Network Debrecen Interim Meeting</td>
<td>Yeşim Işıl Ülman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Moderator:</strong> İnci User</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Kahve Arası / Break

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zaman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14.30-14.45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### DİLEKLER /Projects, Research Suggestions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Çalışma Alanı</th>
<th>Sunucu</th>
<th>Zaman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DİLEKLER /Projects, Research Suggestions</td>
<td>All Group Members</td>
<td>14.45-15.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KAPANIŞ / CLOSING</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Yer / Venue

Acıbadem Üniversitesi Kerem Aydınlar Yerleşkesi, İçerenköy, Kayışdağı Cad. No:32 Ataşehir - İSTANBUL
Meeting Notes:


Decisions:

1) COST Action Themes are proposed to be on:
   - Clinical Ethics Education
   - Assessment of attitude changing effect of Ethics education
   - Clinical Ethics Support
   - A Guideline design for ethics educators
   - Objectives and ways for European wide mutual education (i.e. updating UNESCO Core Curriculum)

2) A Nationwide Bioethics Education Inventory Research by the Turkey Working Group led by Volkan Kavas
   Research team: Volunteers from the Turkey WG
   Ethics Committee approval
   Application for funding Acibadem University and TUBITAK
1st stage: quantitative phase, Data Collection: working on the algorithm (assessment tool) to be sent by Volkan
2nd stage: a qualitative study of meta-analysis

3) A Book on Ethics Education to be edited by M. Volkan Kavas
   - Authors: Bioethics, Public Health, Family Medicine, Medical Education, Health Sociology etc.
   - Publication by Acibadem University or INSEV ...

4) A poster will be prepared by M. Volkan Kavas on the activities of Turkey Working Group to be presented at 3rd Interim Meeting in Debrecen, Dec. 1-2, 2016.
Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education: Working Groups Meeting
III. Interim Meeting
University of Debrecen, Hungary, 1-2 December, 2016

Venue: University of Debrecen, Kenézy Life Sciences Library 3 floor
Map: http://kenezy.lib.unideb.hu/en/getting_here
Organizer: Faculty of Public Health, Department of Behavioral Sciences
Registration: Prior registration via email is a requirement
Contact person: Péter Kakuk, kakuk.peter@sph.unideb.hu
Meeting date: 1 December, 8:30 opens - closes 2 December, 12:00
PARTICIPANTS

Assist. Prof. Dr. M. Volkan Kavas, MD, PhD; Ankara University Faculty of Medicine, Department of History of Medicine and Ethics, Ankara / Turkey. volkankavas@yahoo.com

Prof. Yesim Ulman, MA, MSc, PhD; Professor of Medical History and Ethics (Department Chair) Head of the Social Sciences Institute, School of Medicine, Acibadem University, Istanbul / Turkey. yesimul@yahoo.com

Prof. Guy Widdershoven, Free University of Amsterdam, Medical Center, Head of Department of Medical Humanities, Amsterdam / Netherlands. g.widdershoven@vumc.nl

Assis.Prof. Yolande Voskes, MA, PhD; Free University of Amsterdam, Medical Center, Department of Medical Humanities, Amsterdam / Netherlands. y.voskes@vumc.nl

Dr, Mariëlle Diepeveen, MD, Junior Researcher and Lecturer, Free University of Amsterdam, Medical Center, Department of Medical Humanities, Amsterdam / Netherlands. m.diepeveen@vumc.nl

Emanuele Valenti, MA, PhD; deputy director, Institute for Clinical Ethics Francisco Vallés, European University, Madrid / Spain. emanuele.valenti@universidadeuropea.es

Associ.Prof. János Tóth, MSc, MA, PhD, Habil; University of Szeged, Department of Philosophy, Szeged / Hungary. jtoth@philo.u-szeged.hu

Prof. József Kovács, Dr, MA, PhD, DSc; Semmelweis University, Department of Behavioral Sciences, Head of Department. kovjzs@net.sote.hu

Assis.Prof. Imre Szebik, MD, MA, PhD; Semmelweis University, Department of Behavioral Sciences, Budapest / Hungary. szebik.imre@net.sote.hu

Dr. Andrea Domján, JD, Junior Researcher; Department of Rheumatology, Clinical Center, University of Debrecen, Debrecen / Hungary. domjan.andrea@gmail.com

Kristóf János Bodnár, MA, PhD; Assistant Lecturer, Department of Behavioral Sciences, Faculty of Public Health, University of Debrecen, Debrecen / Hungary. bodnar.janos@sph.unideb.hu

Assis. Prof. Péter Kakuk, MA, PhD; Department of Behavioral Sciences, Faculty of Public Health, University of Debrecen, Debrecen / Hungary. kakuk.peter@sph.unideb.hu

Assoc. Prof. Attila Bánfalvi, MA, PhD; Department of Behavioral Sciences, Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Public Health, University of Debrecen, Debrecen / Hungary. banfalvi.attila@sph.unideb.hu
Cambridge Network 3rd Interim Meeting in Debrecen, Participants of MCD Session

Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education: Working Groups Meeting

1 December 2016, Thursday
Session 1. Bioethics education: Country reports (8:30 – 10:30)
08:00 - 8:30 Registration
08:30 - 9:00 Welcome address
09:00 - 9:30 Rouven Porz: Introducing the new Swiss working group of ethics education.
09:30 - 10:00 Yesim Isil Ulman: *Teaching ethics at the Acibadem University School of Medicine.*
10:00 - 10:30 Volkan Kavas (poster): *A four-year experience of national academic networking: Cambridge Bioethics Education Turkey Working Group.*
10:30 - 11:00 Coffee break
Session 2. Bioethics education: Biotechnology and environmental ethics (11:00 – 12:30)
11:00 - 11:30 János Tóth: *Education of environmental ethics.*
11:30 - 12:00 József Kovács: *Environmental ethics in the medical curriculum.*
12:00 - 12:30 Emanuele Valenti: *Design of an outcome-based curriculum in bioethics for biotechnology students*
12:30 - 14:00 Lunch break / Poster session
Session 3. Bioethics education: Medical curriculum development (14:00-15:30)
14:00 - 14:30 Yolande Voskes: *Integrating ethical and clinical elements in the medical bachelor curriculum: a four weeks course.*
14:30 - 15:00 Mariëlle Diepeveen: *Using the OSCE for the assessment of ethics in the medical curriculum.*
15:00 - 15:30 *Draft papers session. TBA*
15:30 - 16:00 Coffee break
Session 4. Moral Case Deliberation: A participatory experience. (16:00-18:00) session facilitator: Guy Widdershoven
Dinner, 19:30, restaurant: TBA
2 December 2016, Friday
Session: 5. Grant applications, networking, work in progress (8:30 – 12:00)
8:30 - 9:00 Volkan Kavas: Draft application, COST Action/Horizon 2020
9:00 - 9:30 Discussion
9:30 – 10:00 Emauele Valenti: Draft application - Erasmus +
10:00 – 10:30 Péter Kakuk: Draft application - Erasmus +
10:30 - 11:00 Discussion
11:00 – 12:00 Closing the meeting - Way ahead?

Debrecen University
Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education
Working Groups 3. Interim Meeting Report

Brainstorm on research proposal and funding
Debrecen 1-2 December 2016

Cambridge Network with Hungarian Working Group Members in Debrecen Hungary 1 December 2016

Erasmus +

Topics

- Deliberation in context of undergraduate students (focus on pre-clinical phase)
- Clinical presentation model
  - Clinicians expertise
  - Blended learning
- Moral Case Deliberation
- Clinical Medicine, professional & skills
- Ethics rounds
- Qualitative Research - Data Gathering
- Clinical ethics committees
Countries
Spain, Hungary, the Netherlands, Turkey, (UK?)
Italy? They have experience in writing a proposal.

Expertise
Is there enough expertise? For example:
Netherlands: MCD, OSCE
Turkey: simulation, ethics rounds

Draft and feedback
Emanuele will send a draft and others can comment and give feedback. Reactions are due first week of January. Deadline: end of March.

COST

1- ‘Innovation’
Challenges:
- Hidden curriculum (de- professionalism; app generation/ internet)
- Interdisciplinary education
- Immigrants / Immigration

2- (De) Professionalism
   a. App. Generation - Internet
   b. Interdisciplinary education
   c. Cultural Diversity in students, staff and physicians
   d. Brain drain
   e. Discrimination
   f. Human Rights

3- Relativism

4- Doctors decision on justice/ allocation (i.e. book of Samia Hurst)

Challenges: diversity/ immigrants
De- professionalism and stress
Hidden curriculum
Relativism/ human rights
Doctors decisions

Volkan will work this out.
Volkan, Yolande and Guy will make a proposal in spring 2017. To be discussed at the Paris meeting and to be finalized in autumn 2017.
Upcoming Events:

- 7th Cambridge Consortium of Bioethics Education Working Groups Paris Meeting
- Introduction of the Cambridge Network at EACME 2017 Barcelona Conference
  - Working Groups 4th. Interim Meeting (venue and date to be specified)
  - Turkey Working Group 9th Workshop Istanbul (date to be specified)

Alphabetical List of Contributors to the 2017 Annual Report

Andrea Domján
Attila Bánfalvi
Ceren İllikan
Emanuele Valenti
Fatih Artvinli
Figen Demir
Guy Widdershoven
Imre Szebik
Inci User
János Tóth,
József Kovács
Kevser Vatansever
Kristóf János Bodnár,
M. Volkan Kavas
Mariëlle Diepeveen,
Melike Şahiner
Menno de Bree
Metin Cevizci
Nadi Bakircı
Peter Kakuk
Pınar Topsever
Rouven Porz
Yesim Isil Ulman
Yolande Voskes